

Topological four-manifolds with right-angled Artin fundamental groups: corrigendum

Ian Hambleton * and Alyson Hildum[†]

*Department of Mathematics and Statistics
McMaster University
Hamilton, Ontario L8S 4K1, Canada*

*Department of Mathematics
Roger Williams University
1 Old Ferry Road, Bristol, RI 02809, USA
*hambleton@mcmaster.ca
[†]ahildum@rwu.edu*

Received 4 November 2021

Revised 3 April 2024

Accepted 3 April 2024

Published 7 August 2024

We correct the stability bound in our classification of closed, spin^+ , topological four-manifolds with fundamental group π of cohomological dimension ≤ 3 (up to s -cobordism), after stabilization by connected sum with copies of $S^2 \times S^2$. If π is a right-angled Artin group whose defining graphs have no four-cliques, then the new stability bound is $r \geq \max(b_3(\pi), 6)$. The other results of the paper are not affected.

Keywords: Topological 4-manifolds; surgery; right-angled Artin groups.

1. Introduction

We correct the stability bounds used in the statements of Theorems A and 11.2 in our paper [5] (see Sec. 3 for the corrected results, and [4] for subsequent developments). We are indebted to Daniel Kasprowski for pointing out a gap in the last step of our arguments, and to Diarmuid Crowley for a very useful conversation. To explain and repair the error we need to briefly describe the setting.

A standard approach to the classification of topological four-manifolds uses the theory of “modified surgery” due to Matthias Kreck [7, Sec. 6]. We briefly recall some of the features of modified surgery in our setting (see [7, Theorem 4, p. 735] for the notation):

- Let M and N be closed, oriented topological four-manifolds with the same Euler characteristic, which admit normal one-smoothings in a fibration $B \rightarrow B\text{STOP}$.
- If W is a normal B -bordism between these two one-smoothings, with normal B -structure $\bar{\nu}$, then there exists an obstruction $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) \in \ell_5(\pi_1(B))$ which is

elementary if and only if $(W, \bar{\nu})$ is B -bordant relative to the boundary to an s -cobordism.

- Let $\pi := \pi_1(B)$ and $\Lambda := \mathbb{Z}[\pi]$ denote the integral group ring of the fundamental group. The elements of $\ell_5(\pi)$ are represented by pairs $(H(\Lambda^r), V)$, where V is a half-rank direct summand of the hyperbolic form $H(\Lambda^r)$.
- In a pair $(H(\Lambda^r), V)$, if the quadratic form vanishes on V , then the element $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu})$ lies in the image of $L_5(\mathbb{Z}\pi) \rightarrow \ell_5(\pi)$ (see [7, Proposition 8, p. 739] or [7, p. 734] for criteria to ensure that this will happen).

In our applications, we assumed the following “assembly map” conditions.

Definition 1.1. A group π satisfies properties (W–A) whenever

- (i) The Whitehead group $\text{Wh}(\pi)$ vanishes.
- (ii) The assembly map $A_5(\pi): H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ is surjective.

If, in addition, the assembly map $A_4(\pi): H_4(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow L_4(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ is injective, we say that π satisfies properties (W–AA).

Such properties hold whenever the group π is torsion-free and satisfies the Farrell–Jones isomorphism conjectures in K -theory and L -theory (see [4, Sec. 3] for details). These conjectures have been verified for many classes of groups, and in particular for all right-angled Artin groups (see [1, 2]).

If M is a closed, oriented four-manifold with $\pi_1(M, x_0) = \pi$, and π satisfies properties (W–A), we have the *partial assembly* map:

$$A_5(M): H_5(M; \mathbb{L}_0) = H_1(M; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$$

given by composing $A_5(\pi)$ with the induced map $H_5(M; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0)$.

The action of elements in the image $\text{Im } A_5(M) \subseteq L_5(\mathbb{Z}\pi)$ of the partial assembly map on $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) \in \ell_5(\pi_1(B))$ can be defined geometrically by the action of degree 1 normal maps on the B -bordism $(W, \bar{\nu})$.

More precisely, such elements in $L_5(\mathbb{Z}\pi)$ are represented by the surgery obstructions of *inertial* degree 1 normal maps

$$F: (U, \partial_0 U, \partial_1 U) \rightarrow (M \times I, M \times 0, M \times 1).$$

By definition, $\partial_0 U = \partial_1 U = M$, and F restricted to both boundary components is a homeomorphism. Such inertial normal cobordisms can be glued to $(W, \bar{\nu})$ to produce a new B -bordism $(W', \bar{\nu})$ between M and N , with surgery obstruction $\Theta(W', \bar{\nu}) = \Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) + \sigma(F)$ (see the proof of [6, Theorem 2.6]).

This is the argument we proposed for the final step to eliminate the obstruction $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu})$, and thus obtain an s -cobordism between M and N under the assumptions of Theorem 11.2 (and its application to Theorem A). Note that the fundamental groups π in these results all have $\text{cd } \pi \leq 3$.

The Error. By assumption, the assembly map $A_5(\pi)$ in condition (W-A) is surjective, and if $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 4$ its domain:

$$A_5(\pi): H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) = H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$$

is expressed in terms of the low-dimensional group homology of π . However, the above construction can only realize the action of elements in the image of the partial assembly map

$$H_5(M; \mathbb{L}_0) = H_1(M; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$$

from the homology of M . Since the reference map $M \rightarrow B$ is two-connected, the summand $H_1(M; \mathbb{Z}) \cong H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z})$. However, if the map $H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ is not surjective, we will not be able to realize all possible obstructions by this construction.

Remark 1.2. The statements of [6, Theorems 2.2 and 2.6] are a bit misleading, since they appear (incorrectly) to be stated for arbitrary fundamental groups. However, the goal of [6] was to study fundamental groups π of geometric (and hence cohomological) dimension at most two. In these cases, $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) = 0$ so the domain of $A_5(\pi)$ is just $H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z})$, and the problem above does not arise. In contrast, if $\text{cd } \pi = 3$ and $\pi_1(M) = \pi$, then by Poincaré duality:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} H^1(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) & \xleftarrow{\cong} & H^1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \\ \cong \downarrow \cap [M] & & \downarrow c_*[M] \\ H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) & \longrightarrow & H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \end{array}$$

and the map $H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ is zero since $0 = c_*[M] \in H_4(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$.

2. A Stable Range for L -Theory

For any finitely presented group π , the odd-dimensional surgery obstruction groups are defined as $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi]) = SU(\Lambda)/RU(\Lambda)$, in the notation of Wall [10, Chap. 6]. Here, $SU(\Lambda)$ is the limit of the automorphism groups $SU_r(\Lambda)$ of the hyperbolic (quadratic) form $H(\Lambda^r)$ under certain injective maps

$$\dots SU_r(\Lambda) \rightarrow SU_{r+1}(\Lambda) \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow SU(\Lambda)$$

and $RU(\Lambda)$ is a suitable subgroup determined by the surgery data, so that $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ is an abelian group. To define a stable range for groups π with $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$, we will assume that π has type F_3 , meaning that there is a model for the classifying space

$B\pi$ with finite three-skeleton. In particular, groups of type F_3 are finitely presented, but not conversely.

Definition 2.1. For an element $x \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$, we denote its *stable L_5 -range* by

$$\mathfrak{sr}(x) = \min\{r \geq 0 : x \text{ is represented by an matrix in } SU_r(\Lambda)\}.$$

The *stable range* of a finitely presented group π with $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$ is defined as

$$\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi) = \min_{\mathcal{B}} \{ \max\{ \mathfrak{sr}(A_5(\alpha)) : \text{where } \alpha \in \mathcal{B} \text{ varies over a } \mathbb{Z}/2\text{-basis } \mathcal{B} \\ \text{for } H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \} \}.$$

Remark 2.2. If π has type F_3 then the stable range will be finite. In general, $\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$ could be infinite, since there are finitely presented groups with $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ of infinite rank (see Stallings [8]).

Lemma 2.3. *Let π be a right-angled Artin group with $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$. Then $\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi) \leq 6$.*

Proof. Every right-angled Artin group has type F_3 since it is defined by a finite graph. The homology group $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ has $\mathbb{Z}/2$ -rank $b_3(\pi)$, which is equal to the number of three-cliques in the defining graph for π . Moreover, since each three-clique determines a subgroup $\rho \subseteq \pi$, with $\rho \cong \mathbb{Z}^3$, the group $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ is generated by the images of the fundamental classes under all the induced maps $H_3(T^3; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_3(\rho; \mathbb{Z}/2)$. It is therefore enough to determine the stable range for $\rho = \mathbb{Z}^3$.

By definition of the assembly map, we need to determine the minimum representative in $SU_r(\Lambda)$ for the surgery obstruction of the degree one normal map

$$g := (\text{id} \times f): N \times T^2 \rightarrow N \times S^2$$

given by the product of the Arf invariant one normal map $f: T^2 \rightarrow S^2$ with the identity on $N = T^3$. Let $\rho = \pi_1(N) = \mathbb{Z}^3$. After surgery on the generators of

$$K_1(g) = \ker\{H_1(N \times T^2; \Lambda) \rightarrow H_1(N \times S^2; \Lambda)\} = \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z}$$

to obtain (N', g') , we get a two-connected normal map with $K_2(g') = I(\rho) \oplus I(\rho)$, where $I(\rho) := \ker\{\mathbb{Z}[\rho] \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}\}$ is the augmentation ideal of the group ring $\mathbb{Z}[\rho]$. According to the recipe provided by Wall [10, Chap. 6, pp. 58–59], the surgery obstruction is determined by representing generators of $K_2(g')$ by a collection of disjointly embedded framed two-spheres in N' . The process starts by picking an epimorphism from a free Λ -module $\Lambda^r \rightarrow K_2(g')$, which leads to a surgery obstruction automorphism in $SU_r(\Lambda)$ of the hyperbolic form $H(\Lambda^r)$. Since $I(\rho)$ is minimally generated by an epimorphism $\Lambda^3 \rightarrow I(\rho)$, we conclude that an epimorphism $\Lambda^r \rightarrow K_2(g')$ requires $r \geq 6$. $\square$

We will use a stable range condition to realize the action of $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ on a B -bordism, after a suitable stabilization. The following statement is an application of this result in the setting of Kreck [7, Theorem 4].

Proposition 2.4. *Let π be a discrete group with $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$ of type F_3 satisfying properties (W–A). Let M and N be closed, oriented topological four-manifolds with the same Euler characteristic, which admit normal one-smoothings in a fibration $B \rightarrow B\text{STOP}$. Suppose that $(W, \bar{\nu})$ is a normal B -bordism between these two one-smoothings. If $r \geq \mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$, then for any $x \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ there exists a B -bordism $(W', \bar{\nu})$ between the stabilized one-smoothings $M' := M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ and $N' := N \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$, with $\Theta(W', \bar{\nu}) = \Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) + x \in \ell_5(\pi)$.*

Proof. By property (W–A), the assembly map $A_5(\pi): H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ is surjective. The elements $x \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ in the image of $H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}) \cong H_1(M; \mathbb{Z})$ are realized as above (without stabilization). For the elements $x = A_5(\alpha) \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ in the image of $\alpha \in H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$, we use the stabilized version of Wall realization due to Cappell and Shaneson [3, Theorem 3.1].

Any element is the image of a finite sum $\alpha = \sum \alpha_i$ of basis elements of $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$, which all have stable L -range at most $\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$. The realization construction can be done (for each term α_i of the finite sum) in small disjoint intervals

$$M' \times [t_{i-1}, t_i] \subset M' \times [0, 1]$$

with $0 = t_0 < t_1 < \dots < t_k = 1$, to produce degree one normal maps

$$F_i: (U_i, \partial_0 U_i, \partial_1 U_i) \rightarrow (M' \times [t_{i-1}, t_i], M' \times t_{i-1}, M \times t_i), \quad 1 \leq i \leq k,$$

such that $\partial_0 U_i = \partial_1 U_i = M' = M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$. The restrictions of F_i to the boundary components have the property that $F_i|_{\partial_0 U} = \text{id}$, and $F_i|_{\partial_1 U} := f_i$ is a simple homotopy equivalence. In other words, this construction produces elements of the structure set $\mathcal{S}(M')$ represented by self-equivalences of M' .

These normal bordisms can be glued (at disjoint levels) into a collar $M' \times [0, 1]$ attached to the stabilization $W \natural r(S^2 \times S^2 \times I)$ of the given B -bordism, and the reference map to B extended through M . After including all these bordisms, the induced homotopy equivalence with target $M' \times 1$ is the composite $f := f_1 \circ f_2 \circ \dots \circ f_k$. The surgery obstruction over the collar $M' \times [0, 1]$ is $x = A_5(\alpha) = \sum A_5(\alpha_i)$, and the result follows. $\square$

The following application of the theory in Kreck [7, Sec. 6] may be useful in cases where a potentially harder bordism calculation is feasible.

Corollary 2.5. *If M and N are closed, oriented topological four-manifolds with fundamental group π of type F_3 which admit B -bordant normal two-smoothings in the same fibration $B \rightarrow B\text{STOP}$, then they are s -cobordant after at most $\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$ stabilizations, provided that $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$ and π satisfies properties (W–A).*

Proof. For normal two-smoothings of M and N , the reference maps are three-connected. In this case, Kreck [7, p. 734] shows that the surgery obstruction $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu})$ of a B -bordism $(W, \bar{\nu})$ lies in the image of $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi]) \rightarrow \ell_5(\pi)$. The result now follows from Proposition 2.4. $\square$

Remark 2.6. The definition of the stable range for elements in $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ and the results of this section have been generalized in [4, Sec. 4] to all discrete groups π which are *geometrically n -dimensional*, or $\text{g-dim}(\pi) \leq n$, meaning that there is a finite aspherical n -complex with fundamental group π . This leads to further applications of the stable range condition. Note that $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$ implies $\text{g-dim}(\pi) \leq 3$ (see [9, Theorem E]).

3. The Main Results Corrected

To correct the statements of [5, Theorems A and 11.2], we add the new stable range conditions to the previous stability estimate $r \geq b_3(\pi)$. Recall that $b_3(\pi)$ denotes the minimum number of generators for $H^3(\pi; \Lambda)$ as a Λ -module. For a right-angled Artin group, $b_3(\pi)$ equals the number of three-cliques in the defining graph for π .

Theorem A. *Let π be a right-angled Artin group defined by a graph Γ with no four-cliques. Suppose that M and N are closed, spin^+ , topological four-manifolds with fundamental group π . Then any isometry between the quadratic two-types of M and N is stably realized by an s -cobordism between $M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ and $N \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$, whenever $r \geq \max\{6, b_3(\pi)\}$.*

As shown in the paper [5], this is a consequence of our main result:

Theorem 11.2. *Let π be a discrete group of type F_3 with $\text{cd } \pi \leq 3$ satisfying the properties (W-AA). If M and N are closed, oriented, spin^+ , TOP four-manifolds with fundamental group π , then any isometry between the quadratic two-types of M and N is stably realized by an s -cobordism between $M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ and $N \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$, for $r \geq \max\{b_3(\pi), \text{sr}_3(\pi)\}$.*

Remark 3.1. Note that we obtain s -cobordisms after connected sum with a *uniformly bounded* number of copies of $S^2 \times S^2$, where the bound depends only on the fundamental group. In contrast, “stable classification” results (such as [5, Theorem B]) might require an unbounded number of stabilizations as the manifolds M and N vary.

Acknowledgment

This research partially supported by NSERC Discovery Grant No. A4000.

ORCID

Ian Hambleton  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7501-463X>

References

1. A. Bartels, F. T. Farrell and W. Lück, The Farrell-Jones conjecture for cocompact lattices in virtually connected Lie groups, *J. Amer. Math. Soc.* **27** (2014) 339–388.
2. A. Bartels and W. Lück, The Borel conjecture for hyperbolic and CAT(0)-groups, *Ann. Math. (2)* **175** (2012) 631–689.
3. S. E. Cappell and J. L. Shaneson, On four dimensional surgery and applications, *Comment. Math. Helv.* **46** (1971) 500–528.
4. I. Hambleton, A stability range for topological 4-manifolds, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **376** (2023) 8769–8793.
5. I. Hambleton and A. Hildum, Topological 4-manifolds with right-angled Artin fundamental groups, *J. Topol. Anal.* **11** (2019) 777–821.
6. I. Hambleton, M. Kreck and P. Teichner, Topological 4-manifolds with geometrically 2-dimensional fundamental groups, *J. Topol. Anal.* **1** (2009) 123–151.
7. M. Kreck, Surgery and duality, *Ann. Math. (2)* **149** (1999) 707–754.
8. J. Stallings, A finitely presented group whose 3-dimensional integral homology is not finitely generated, *Amer. J. Math.* **85** (1963) 541–543.
9. C. T. C. Wall, Finiteness conditions for *CW*-complexes, *Ann. Math. (2)* **81** (1965) 56–69.
10. C. T. C. Wall, *Surgery on Compact Manifolds*, 2nd edn. (American Mathematical Society, 1999). Edited and with a foreword by A. A. Ranicki.