

# TOPOLOGICAL 4-MANIFOLDS WITH RIGHT-ANGLED ARTIN FUNDAMENTAL GROUPS: CORRIGENDUM

IAN HAMBLETON AND ALYSON HILDUM

ABSTRACT. We correct the stability bound in our classification of closed,  $\text{spin}^+$ , topological 4-manifolds with fundamental group  $\pi$  of cohomological dimension  $\leq 3$  (up to  $s$ -cobordism), after stabilization by connected sum with copies of  $S^2 \times S^2$ . If  $\pi$  is a right-angled Artin group whose defining graphs have no 4-cliques, then the new stability bound is  $r \geq \max(b_3(\pi), 6)$ . The other results of the paper are not affected.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

We correct the stability bounds used in the statements of Theorem A and Theorem 11.2 in our paper [5] (see Section 3 for the corrected results, and [4] for subsequent developments). We are indebted to Daniel Kasprowski for pointing out a gap in the last step of our arguments, and to Diarmuid Crowley for a very useful conversation. To explain and repair the error we need to briefly describe the setting.

A standard approach to the classification of topological 4-manifolds uses the theory of “modified surgery” due to Matthias Kreck [7, §6]. We briefly recall some of the features of modified surgery in our setting (see [7, Theorem 4, p. 735] for the notation):

- Let  $M$  and  $N$  be closed, oriented topological 4-manifolds with the same Euler characteristic, which admit normal 1-smoothings in a fibration  $B \rightarrow BSTOP$ .
- If  $W$  is a normal  $B$ -bordism between these two 1-smoothings, with normal  $B$ -structure  $\bar{\nu}$ , then there exists an obstruction  $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) \in \ell_5(\pi_1(B))$  which is *elementary* if and only if  $(W, \bar{\nu})$  is  $B$ -bordant relative to the boundary to an  $s$ -cobordism.
- Let  $\pi := \pi_1(B)$  and  $\Lambda := \mathbb{Z}[\pi]$  denote the integral group ring of the fundamental group. The elements of  $\ell_5(\pi)$  are represented by pairs  $(H(\Lambda^r), V)$ , where  $V$  is a half-rank direct summand of the hyperbolic form  $H(\Lambda^r)$ .
- In a pair  $(H(\Lambda^r), V)$ , if the quadratic form vanishes on  $V$ , then the element  $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu})$  lies in the image of  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}\pi) \rightarrow \ell_5(\pi)$  (see [7, Proposition 8, p. 739] or [7, p. 734] for criteria to ensure that this will happen).

In our applications, we assumed the following “assembly map” conditions.

**Definition 1.1.** A group  $\pi$  satisfies properties (W-A) whenever

- (i) The Whitehead group  $\text{Wh}(\pi)$  vanishes.
- (ii) The assembly map  $A_5(\pi): H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  is surjective.

If, in addition, the assembly map  $A_4(\pi): H_4(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow L_4(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  is injective, we say that  $\pi$  satisfies properties (W-AA).

---

*Date:* April 2, 2024.

Research partially supported by NSERC Discovery Grant A4000.

These properties hold whenever the group  $\pi$  is torsion-free and satisfies the Farrell-Jones isomorphism conjectures in  $K$ -theory and  $L$ -theory (see [4, §3] for details). These conjectures have been verified for many classes of groups, and in particular for all right-angled Artin groups (see [2], [1]).

If  $M$  is a closed, oriented 4-manifold with  $\pi_1(M, x_0) = \pi$ , and  $\pi$  satisfies properties (W-A), we have the *partial assembly* map:

$$A_5(M): H_5(M; \mathbb{L}_0) = H_1(M; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$$

given by composing  $A_5(\pi)$  with the induced map  $H_5(M; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0)$ .

The action of elements in the image  $\text{Im } A_5(M) \subseteq L_5(\mathbb{Z}\pi)$  of the partial assembly map on  $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) \in \ell_5(\pi_1(B))$  can be defined geometrically by the action of degree 1 normal maps on the  $B$ -bordism  $(W, \bar{\nu})$ .

More precisely, such elements in  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}\pi)$  are represented by the surgery obstructions of *inertial* degree 1 normal maps

$$F: (U, \partial_0 U, \partial_1 U) \rightarrow (M \times I, M \times 0, M \times 1).$$

By definition,  $\partial_0 U = \partial_1 U = M$ , and  $F$  restricted to both boundary components is a homeomorphism. Such inertial normal cobordisms can be glued to  $(W, \bar{\nu})$  to produce a new  $B$ -bordism  $(W', \bar{\nu})$  between  $M$  and  $N$ , with surgery obstruction  $\Theta(W', \bar{\nu}) = \Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) + \sigma(F)$  (see the proof of [6, Theorem 2.6]).

This is the argument we proposed for the final step to eliminate the obstruction  $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu})$ , and thus obtain an  $s$ -cobordism between  $M$  and  $N$  under the assumptions of Theorem 11.2 (and its application to Theorem A). Note that the fundamental groups  $\pi$  in these results all have  $\text{cd } \pi \leq 3$ .

**The Error:** By assumption, the assembly map  $A_5(\pi)$  in condition (W-A) is surjective, and if  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 4$  its domain:

$$A_5(\pi): H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) = H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi]),$$

is expressed in terms of the low dimensional group homology of  $\pi$ . However, the above construction can only realize the action of elements in the image of the partial assembly map

$$H_5(M; \mathbb{L}_0) = H_1(M; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_5(\pi; \mathbb{L}_0) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$$

from the homology of  $M$ . Since the reference map  $M \rightarrow B$  is 2-connected, the summand  $H_1(M; \mathbb{Z}) \cong H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z})$ . However, if the map  $H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$  is not surjective, we will not be able to realize all possible obstructions by this construction.

**Remark 1.2.** The statements of [6, Theorems 2.2 & 2.6] are a bit misleading, since they appear (incorrectly) to be stated for arbitrary fundamental groups. However, the goal of [6] was to study fundamental groups  $\pi$  of geometric (and hence cohomological) dimension at most two. In these cases,  $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) = 0$  so the domain of  $A_5(\pi)$  is just  $H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z})$ , and the problem above does not arise. In contrast, if  $\text{cd } \pi = 3$  and  $\pi_1(M) = \pi$ , then by Poincaré duality:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} H^1(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) & \xleftarrow{\cong} & H^1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \\ \cong \downarrow \cap[M] & & \downarrow c_*[M] \\ H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) & \longrightarrow & H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \end{array}$$

and the map  $H_3(M; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$  is zero since  $0 = c_*[M] \in H_4(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ .

## 2. A STABLE RANGE FOR $L$ -THEORY

For any finitely presented group  $\pi$ , the odd dimensional surgery obstruction groups are defined as  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi]) = SU(\Lambda)/RU(\Lambda)$ , in the notation of Wall [10, Chap. 6]. Here  $SU(\Lambda)$  is the limit of the automorphism groups  $SU_r(\Lambda)$  of the hyperbolic (quadratic) form  $H(\Lambda^r)$  under certain injective maps

$$\dots SU_r(\Lambda) \rightarrow SU_{r+1}(\Lambda) \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow SU(\Lambda),$$

and  $RU(\Lambda)$  is a suitable subgroup determined by the surgery data, so that  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  is an abelian group. To define a stable range for groups  $\pi$  with  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$ , we will assume that  $\pi$  has *type*  $F_3$ , meaning that there is a model for the classifying space  $B\pi$  with finite 3-skeleton. In particular, groups of type  $F_3$  are finitely presented, but not conversely.

**Definition 2.1.** For an element  $x \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$ , we denote its *stable  $L_5$ -range* by:

$$\text{sr}(x) = \min\{r \geq 0 : x \text{ is represented by an matrix in } SU_r(\Lambda)\}.$$

The *stable range* of a finitely presented group  $\pi$  with  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$  is defined as:

$$\text{sr}_3(\pi) = \min_{\mathcal{B}} \{\max\{\text{sr}(A_5(\alpha)) : \text{where } \alpha \in \mathcal{B} \text{ varies over a } \mathbb{Z}/2\text{-basis } \mathcal{B} \text{ for } H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)\}\}.$$

**Remark 2.2.** If  $\pi$  has type  $F_3$  then the stable range will be finite. In general,  $\text{sr}_3(\pi)$  could be infinite, since there are finitely presented groups with  $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$  of infinite rank (see Stallings [8]).

**Lemma 2.3.** *Let  $\pi$  be a right-angled Artin group with  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$ . Then  $\text{sr}_3(\pi) \leq 6$ .*

*Proof.* Every right-angled Artin group has type  $F_3$  since it is defined by a finite graph. The homology group  $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$  has  $\mathbb{Z}/2$ -rank  $b_3(\pi)$ , which is equal to the number of 3-cliques in the defining graph for  $\pi$ . Moreover, since each 3-clique determines a subgroup  $\rho \subseteq \pi$ , with  $\rho \cong \mathbb{Z}^3$ , the group  $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$  is generated by the images of the fundamental classes under all the induced maps  $H_3(T^3; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ . It is therefore enough to determine the stable range for  $\rho = \mathbb{Z}^3$ .

By definition of the assembly map, we need to determine the minimum representative in  $SU_r(\Lambda)$  for the surgery obstruction of the degree one normal map

$$g := (\text{id} \times f): N \times T^2 \rightarrow N \times S^2$$

given by the the product of the Arf invariant one normal map  $f: T^2 \rightarrow S^2$  with the identity on  $N = T^3$ . Let  $\rho = \pi_1(N) = \mathbb{Z}^3$ . After surgery on the generators of

$$K_1(g) = \ker\{H_1(N \times T^2; \Lambda) \rightarrow H_1(N \times S^2; \Lambda)\} = \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z}$$

to obtain  $(N', g')$ , we get a 2-connected normal map with  $K_2(g') = I(\rho) \oplus I(\rho)$ , where  $I(\rho) := \ker\{\mathbb{Z}[\rho] \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}\}$  is the augmentation ideal of the group ring  $\mathbb{Z}[\rho]$ . According to the recipe provided by Wall [10, Chap. 6, pp. 58-59], the surgery obstruction is determined by representing generators of  $K_2(g')$  by a collection of disjointly embedded framed 2-spheres in  $N'$ . The process starts by picking an epimorphism from a free  $\Lambda$ -module  $\Lambda^r \rightarrow K_2(g')$ , which leads to a surgery obstruction automorphism in  $SU_r(\Lambda)$  of the hyperbolic form  $H(\Lambda^r)$ . Since  $I(\rho)$  is minimally generated by an epimorphism  $\Lambda^3 \rightarrow I(\rho)$ , we conclude that an epimorphism  $\Lambda^r \rightarrow K_2(g')$  requires  $r \geq 6$ .  $\square$

We will use a stable range condition to realize the action of  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  on a  $B$ -bordism, after a suitable stabilization. The following statement is an application of this result in the setting of Kreck [7, Theorem 4].

**Proposition 2.4.** *Let  $\pi$  be a discrete group with  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$  of type  $F_3$  satisfying properties (W-A). Let  $M$  and  $N$  be closed, oriented topological 4-manifolds with the same Euler characteristic, which admit normal 1-smoothings in a fibration  $B \rightarrow B\text{STOP}$ . Suppose that  $(W, \bar{\nu})$  is a normal  $B$ -bordism between these two 1-smoothings. If  $r \geq \mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$ , then for any  $x \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  there exists a  $B$ -bordism  $(W', \bar{\nu})$  between the stabilized 1-smoothings  $M' := M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$  and  $N' := N \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ , with  $\Theta(W', \bar{\nu}) = \Theta(W, \bar{\nu}) + x \in \ell_5(\pi)$ .*

*Proof.* By property (W-A), the assembly map  $A_5(\pi): H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2) \rightarrow L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  is surjective. The elements  $x \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  in the image of  $H_1(\pi; \mathbb{Z}) \cong H_1(M; \mathbb{Z})$  are realized as above (without stabilization). For the elements  $x = A_5(\alpha) \in L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  in the image of  $\alpha \in H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ , we use the stabilized version of Wall realization due to Cappell and Shaneson [3, Theorem 3.1].

Any element is the image of a finite sum  $\alpha = \sum \alpha_i$  of basis elements of  $H_3(\pi; \mathbb{Z}/2)$ , which all have stable  $L$ -range at most  $\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$ . The realization construction can be done (for each term  $\alpha_i$  of the finite sum) in small disjoint intervals

$$M' \times [t_{i-1}, t_i] \subset M' \times [0, 1],$$

with  $0 = t_0 < t_1 < \dots < t_k = 1$ , to produce degree one normal maps

$$F_i: (U_i, \partial_0 U_i, \partial_1 U_i) \rightarrow (M' \times [t_{i-1}, t_i], M' \times t_{i-1}, M \times t_i), \quad 1 \leq i \leq k,$$

such that  $\partial_0 U_i = \partial_1 U_i = M' = M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ . The restrictions of  $F_i$  to the boundary components have the property that  $F_i|_{\partial_0 U} = \text{id}$ , and  $F_i|_{\partial_1 U} := f_i$  is a simple homotopy equivalence. In other words, this construction produces elements of the structure set  $\mathcal{S}(M')$  represented by self-equivalences of  $M'$ .

These normal bordisms can be glued (at disjoint levels) into a collar  $M' \times [0, 1]$  attached to the stabilization  $W \natural r(S^2 \times S^2 \times I)$  of the given  $B$ -bordism, and the reference map to  $B$  extended through  $M$ . After including all these bordisms, the induced homotopy equivalence with target  $M' \times 1$  is the composite  $f := f_1 \circ f_2 \circ \dots \circ f_k$ . The surgery obstruction over the collar  $M' \times [0, 1]$  is  $x = A_5(\alpha) = \sum A_5(\alpha_i)$ , and the result follows.  $\square$

The following application of the theory in Kreck [7, §6] may be useful in cases where a potentially harder bordism calculation is feasible.

**Corollary 2.5.** *If  $M$  and  $N$  are closed, oriented topological 4-manifolds with fundamental group  $\pi$  of type  $F_3$  which admit  $B$ -bordant normal 2-smoothings in the same fibration  $B \rightarrow B\text{STOP}$ , then they are  $s$ -cobordant after at most  $\mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)$  stabilizations, provided that  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$  and  $\pi$  satisfies properties (W-A).*

*Proof.* For normal 2-smoothings of  $M$  and  $N$ , the reference maps are 3-connected. In this case, Kreck [7, p. 734] shows that the surgery obstruction  $\Theta(W, \bar{\nu})$  of a  $B$ -bordism  $(W, \bar{\nu})$  lies in the image of  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi]) \rightarrow \ell_5(\pi)$ . The result now follows from Proposition 2.4.  $\square$

**Remark 2.6.** The definition of the stable range for elements in  $L_5(\mathbb{Z}[\pi])$  and the results of this section have been generalized in [4, §4] to all discrete groups  $\pi$  which are *geometrically  $n$ -dimensional*, or  $\text{g-dim}(\pi) \leq n$ , meaning that there is a finite aspherical  $n$ -complex with fundamental group  $\pi$ . This leads to further applications of the stable range condition. Note that  $\text{cd}(\pi) \leq 3$  implies  $\text{g-dim}(\pi) \leq 3$  (see [9, Theorem E]).

## 3. THE MAIN RESULTS CORRECTED

To correct the statements of Theorem A and Theorem 11.2 in [5], we add the new stable range conditions to the previous stability estimate  $r \geq b_3(\pi)$ . Recall that  $b_3(\pi)$  denotes the minimum number of generators for  $H^3(\pi; \Lambda)$  as a  $\Lambda$ -module. For a right-angled Artin group,  $b_3(\pi)$  equals the number of 3-cliques in the defining graph for  $\pi$ .

**Theorem A.** *Let  $\pi$  be a right-angled Artin group defined by a graph  $\Gamma$  with no 4-cliques. Suppose that  $M$  and  $N$  are closed,  $\text{spin}^+$ , topological 4-manifolds with fundamental group  $\pi$ . Then any isometry between the quadratic 2-types of  $M$  and  $N$  is stably realized by an  $s$ -cobordism between  $M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$  and  $N \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ , whenever  $r \geq \max\{6, b_3(\pi)\}$ .*

As shown in the paper [5], this is a consequence of our main result:

**Theorem 11.2.** *Let  $\pi$  be a discrete group of type  $F_3$  with  $\text{cd } \pi \leq 3$  satisfying the properties (W-AA). If  $M$  and  $N$  are closed, oriented,  $\text{spin}^+$ , TOP 4-manifolds with fundamental group  $\pi$ , then any isometry between the quadratic 2-types of  $M$  and  $N$  is stably realized by an  $s$ -cobordism between  $M \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$  and  $N \# r(S^2 \times S^2)$ , for  $r \geq \max\{b_3(\pi), \mathfrak{sr}_3(\pi)\}$ .*

**Remark 3.1.** Note that we obtain  $s$ -cobordisms after connected sum with a *uniformly bounded* number of copies of  $S^2 \times S^2$ , where the bound depends only on the fundamental group. In contrast, “stable classification” results (such as [5, Theorem B]) might require an unbounded number of stabilizations as the manifolds  $M$  and  $N$  vary.

## REFERENCES

- [1] A. Bartels, F. T. Farrell, and W. Lück, *The Farrell-Jones conjecture for cocompact lattices in virtually connected Lie groups*, J. Amer. Math. Soc. **27** (2014), 339–388.
- [2] A. Bartels and W. Lück, *The Borel conjecture for hyperbolic and CAT(0)-groups*, Ann. of Math. (2) **175** (2012), 631–689.
- [3] S. E. Cappell and J. L. Shaneson, *On four dimensional surgery and applications*, Comment. Math. Helv. **46** (1971), 500–528.
- [4] I. Hambleton, *A stability range for topological 4-manifolds*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **376** (2023), 8769–8793.
- [5] I. Hambleton and A. Hildum, *Topological 4-manifolds with right-angled Artin fundamental groups*, J. Topol. Anal. **11** (2019), 777–821.
- [6] I. Hambleton, M. Kreck, and P. Teichner, *Topological 4-manifolds with geometrically 2-dimensional fundamental groups*, Journal of Topology and Analysis **1** (2009), 123–151.
- [7] M. Kreck, *Surgery and duality*, Ann. of Math. (2) **149** (1999), 707–754.
- [8] J. Stallings, *A finitely presented group whose 3-dimensional integral homology is not finitely generated*, Amer. J. Math. **85** (1963), 541–543.
- [9] C. T. C. Wall, *Finiteness conditions for CW-complexes*, Ann. of Math. (2) **81** (1965), 56–69.
- [10] \_\_\_\_\_, *Surgery on compact manifolds*, second ed., American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 1999, Edited and with a foreword by A. A. Ranicki.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS & STATISTICS  
 MCMASTER UNIVERSITY  
 HAMILTON, ON L8S 4K1, CANADA  
 E-mail address: hambleton@mcmaster.ca

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS  
 ROGER WILLIAMS UNIVERSITY  
 1 OLD FERRY ROAD, BRISTOL, RI 02809  
 E-mail address: ahildum@rwu.edu