

### Section 3.2 Question 7

Suppose that  $x + y = 2y - x$  and  $x$  and  $y$  are not both zero. Prove that  $y \neq 0$ .

**Answer:** Suppose for a contradiction that  $y = 0$ . Since  $x$  and  $y$  cannot both be zero (given), we know that  $x \neq 0$ . However,  $x + y = 2y - x$  tells us (through rearranging) that  $2x = y$  and since  $y = 0$  we conclude that  $x = 0$  as well, contradicting what we got above (that  $x \neq 0$ ), therefore our initial assumption that  $y = 0$  must have been false.

### Section 3.2 Question 12

Consider the following incorrect theorem:

**Incorrect Theorem.** Suppose that  $A \subseteq C$ ,  $B \subseteq C$ , and  $x \in A$ . Then  $x \in B$ .

- (a) What's wrong with the following proof of the theorem?

*Proof.* Suppose that  $x \notin B$ . Since  $x \in A$  and  $A \subseteq C$ ,  $x \in C$ . Since  $x \notin B$  and  $B \subseteq C$ ,  $x \notin C$ . But now we have proven both  $x \in C$  and  $x \notin C$ , so we have reached a contradiction. Therefore  $x \in B$ .

**Answer:** The underlined sentence in the proof is incorrect, the rest is correct. The underlined sentence claims that  $x \notin B$  and  $B \subseteq C$  allows us to conclude that  $x \notin C$ , but this is not the case.

- (b) Show that the theorem is incorrect by finding a counterexample.

**Answer:** There are many appropriate counterexamples.

A very simple one is:  $A = \{1\}$ ,  $B = \{2\}$ ,  $C = \{1, 2\}$  and  $x = 1$ .

A more complicated one:  $A = \mathbb{Z}$  (the integers),  $B = \mathbb{N}$  (the natural numbers),  $C = \mathbb{R}$  (the real numbers) and  $x = -1$ .

Any situation where  $A \not\subseteq B$  ( $A$  is not a subset of  $B$ ) will work.